

Safeguarding Our Oceans

Strengthening marine protection
in New Zealand

Kate Mulcahy, Raewyn Peart
and Abbie Bull

eds 
ENVIRONMENTAL DEFENCE SOCIETY

Safeguarding Our Oceans

**Strengthening marine protection
in New Zealand**

Environmental Defence Society Publications

EDS Guide Series

Managing Biodiversity (forthcoming)

Strengthening Second Generation Regional Policy Statements (2011)

Managing Freshwater (2010)

Managing the Marine Environment (2010)

The New Zealanders' Guide to the Resource Management Act 1991 3rd edition (2008) in association with Craig Potton Publishing

The Community Guide to Landscape Protection under the Resource Management Act 1991 (2005)

The Community Guide to Coastal Development under the Resource Management Act 1991 (2005)

Landscape Planning Guide for Peri-urban and Rural Areas (2005)

Other publications

Wonders of the Sea: The Protection of New Zealand's Marine Mammals, EDS Policy Report (2012)

Governing our Oceans: Environmental reform for the Exclusive Economic Zone, EDS Policy Paper (2011)

Improving Environmental Governance: The role of an Environmental Protection Authority in New Zealand, EDS Policy Paper (2009)

Building Castles in the Sand: The Transformation of New Zealand's Coast (2009) in association with Craig Potton Publishing

Beyond the Tide: Integrating the Management of New Zealand's Coast 2nd edition (2009)

Beyond the RMA: An In-depth Exploration of the Resource Management Act 2001 (2007)

Looking Out to Sea: New Zealand as a Model for Oceans Governance (2005)

A Place to Stand: The Protection of New Zealand's Natural and Cultural Landscapes (2004)

Reclaiming our Heritage: The New Zealand Landscape Conference (2003)

Ordering publications

Publications can be ordered online at www.eds.org.nz,

by phone at +64 9 835 4350 or by writing to:

Environmental Defence Society Incorporated

P O Box 95 152, Swanson

Auckland 0653, New Zealand

Safeguarding Our Oceans

**Strengthening marine protection
in New Zealand**

Kate Mulcahy, Raewyn Peart and Abbie Bull



First published 2012

Published by:

Environmental Defence Society Incorporated

P O Box 95 152

Swanson

Auckland 0653

New Zealand

Phone (09) 835 4350

manager@eds.org.nz

www.eds.org.nz

www.rmaguide.org.nz

ISBN 978-0-9876660-2-4

This book is copyright. Apart from any fair dealing for the purpose of private study, research, criticism or review, as permitted under the Copyright Act, no part may be reproduced by any process without the permission of the publishers.

© Environmental Defence Society Incorporated 2012

Artwork: Neale Wills – Wilsy Design & Production

Photograph credits: Roger Grace – images on the cover and on pages 1, 19, 65, 91 and 133



Printed on Digital Silk stock by Fusion Print Group Ltd who are certified to Enviro-Mark Diamond level. Digital Silk is produced using ECF pulp sourced from well managed forests and manufactured under the strict ISO14001 Environmental Management System.

Contents

1	Introduction	1
	Context	2
	Purpose of report	5
	Structure and methodology	5
	Acknowledgements	6
	PART ONE: INTERNATIONAL REVIEW	7
2	International evolution of spatial marine protection	9
	The genesis of marine protection	10
	Establishing marine protected areas	12
	Move to ecologically representative networks	13
	Building linkages with broader marine management	14
	Conclusion	15
3	Potential benefits of marine protected areas	19
	Protection of biodiversity	20
	Increased productivity	21
	Increased resilience and maintenance of ecosystem services	21
	Benchmarking of environmental health	23
	Fisheries spill-over	23
	Protection of geological processes	24
	Protection of cultural values	24
	Increased recreational and tourism opportunities	25
	Conclusion	26
4	International approaches to marine protection	29
	English marine conservation zones	30
	California Marine Life Protection Act	32
	Australian Commonwealth marine reserves	35
	New South Wales marine parks	38
	Conclusion	41
	Legislative framework	41
	Management measures	41
	Design and implementation	42

5	Elements of international best practice	49
	Marine protected area design	50
	Goals	50
	Scale	50
	Network design principles	52
	Management measures	54
	Zoning	54
	Classification systems	54
	Importance of no-take zones	56
	Integration with marine spatial planning	56
	Process for designing new marine protected areas	57
	Leadership and decision-making	58
	Resourcing	58
	Stakeholder involvement	58
	Information	60
	Monitoring and enforcement	61
	PART TWO: NEW ZEALAND'S PERFORMANCE	63
6	Why New Zealand needs marine protection	65
	Large and biodiverse marine area	66
	Many marine species yet to be discovered	68
	High social and cultural values	68
	High commercial values	69
	Tourism	69
	Oil and gas extraction	69
	Seafood industry	70
	Seabed mining	70
	Significant pressures	71
7	New Zealand's experience with collaborative processes	75
	Fiordland Marine Guardians	76
	West Coast Marine Protection Forum	78
	Sub-Antarctic Marine Protection Planning Forum	81
	Conclusions	83
	Legislative framework	83
	Management measures	84
	Design and implementation	84
	Ongoing management	85

8	New Zealand's performance compared with international best practice	91
	Historical context	92
	Current marine protection tools	93
	Purpose of marine protection	96
	Marine protected area design	98
	Management measures	99
	Process	101
	Leadership and decision-making	101
	Stakeholder involvement	102
	Provision for tāngata whenua interests	105
	Integration with wider ecosystems-based management	108
	Marine protection outcomes	108
	Conclusion	113
9	Legislative design considerations	117
	Scope	118
	Narrow scope	118
	Broader scope	119
	Purpose	120
	Narrow purpose	120
	Broader purpose	121
	Management measures	121
	No classification system	121
	Classification system	122
	Linkages with wider ecosystem-based marine management	123
	Identification undertaken independently	123
	Identification undertaken as part of marine spatial planning	124
	Stakeholder involvement in marine protected area planning	125
	Government-led approach	125
	Collaborative approach	127
	The issue of compensation	128
	Who decides on new marine protected areas?	129
	Joint decision-making	129
	Sole decision-maker	129
	Conclusion	130
10	New legislation options	133
	Option 1: Promulgate the Marine Reserves Bill 2002	134

Option 2: Draft new marine protected areas legislation which provides for an integrated approach to marine protected areas	135
Description	135
Assessment	136
Option 3: Draft new framework oceans legislation which provides for marine spatial planning incorporating marine protected areas (oceans reform)	137
Description	137
Assessment	138
Conclusion	140
11 Recommendations	141
Legislative Framework	142
Marine protected area establishment process	144
Management, monitoring and enforcement	145
Longer-term oceans reform	146
PART THREE: CASE STUDIES	149
12 English marine conservation zones	151
Introduction	152
Context	153
Economic benefits	153
History of marine protection	153
Legislative framework	155
Reform of marine management in the United Kingdom	155
The Marine and Coastal Access Act 2009	156
Marine conservation zone identification process	158
Structure	158
Process	160
Network design	162
Ecological network guidance	162
Management measures	164
Reference areas	165
Implementation, monitoring and enforcement	165
Relationship with marine spatial planning	167
Analysis	168
Was it successful?	168
Data	168

Evaluation of the proposed network	169
Uncertainty regarding process	169
Uncertainty over management measures	170
Conservation objectives	171
Opposition to reference areas	172
Key reasons for success	173
Conclusion	174
13 California Marine Life Protection Act	177
Introduction	178
Context	178
Economic context	178
History of marine protection	179
Legislative framework	181
Marine Life Protection Act	181
Marine Managed Areas Improvement Act	184
Early attempts at implementing the Marine Life Protection Act	186
The California Marine Life Protection Act Initiative	187
Overview	187
Organisational structure, roles and responsibilities	188
Overview of process	190
Spatial decision support system	192
Funding	194
Monitoring and review	194
Incorporating traditional use	196
Analysis	196
Was it successful?	196
Adequate public and private funding	200
Region-by-region approach	200
A legal mandate and political will	201
Role of MarineMap	201
Role of the Blue Ribbon Task Force	201
Role of the science advisory team	201
Clear science guidelines for marine protected area design	202
Effective public communication methods	202
Conclusion	202

14 Australian Commonwealth marine reserves	205
Introduction	206
Context	206
Economic context	206
History of marine protection	207
Legislative framework	207
Environment Protection and Biodiversity Conservation Act	207
Declaration process	208
Management	209
Commonwealth marine protected areas program	211
Marine bioregional planning	214
South-east Commonwealth marine reserves network	216
Provision for indigenous rights	217
Conflict resolution mechanisms and compensation for affected parties	218
Great Barrier Reef structural adjustment package	220
Cod Grounds structural adjustment package	222
Analysis	222
Was it successful?	222
Strong guidance for marine protected area design	223
Flexible approach	224
Top-down approach	224
Bioregional approach	224
Single jurisdiction	224
Conclusion	225
15 New South Wales marine parks	229
Introduction	230
Context	230
Legislative framework	232
Marine Parks Act 1997	232
Marine Parks Authority	232
Marine Parks Advisory Council	233
Management and zoning	233
Consenting	237
Operational plan	237
Monitoring and research	238
Provision for indigenous rights	238

Implementation	239
Scientific audit	242
Analysis	243
Was it successful?	243
Clear legislative guidance	244
‘Top down’ approach	244
Focus on large multi-use marine parks	244
Adaptive management	245
Conclusion	245
16 Fiordland Marine Guardians	247
Introduction	248
Context	249
Social and economic environment	249
Natural environment	250
Existing marine protection	251
Southland Regional Coastal Plan	252
Stakeholder body	252
Establishment	252
Purpose	253
Membership	255
Process	257
Overview	257
Role of stakeholder body	257
Role of statutory agencies	257
Information and science	258
Public consultation	260
Outcomes	260
Stakeholder recommendations	260
Fishing restrictions	261
Government response	261
The Fiordland (Te Moana o Atawhenua) Marine Management Act 2005	261
Functions of the Guardians	262
Relationship to other legislation	262
Moratorium on further protection	262
Marine reserves	263

Future	263
Strengths of the approach	265
Process and consensus-building approach	265
Broad focus	265
Weaknesses of the approach	266
Lack of conservation values	266
Dominance of use rights	267
Effectiveness of tools	268
Conclusions of the independent evaluation	268
Conclusion	269
17 West Coast Marine Protection Forum	273
Introduction	274
Context	274
Social and economic environment	274
Natural environment	276
Existing marine protection	278
Stakeholder body	278
Establishment	278
Purpose	279
Membership	279
Process	281
Overview	281
Role of stakeholder body	281
Role of statutory agencies	283
Information and science	283
Public consultation	285
Outcomes	286
Stakeholder recommendations	286
Kahurangi	286
Punakaiki	287
Ōkārito	288
Gorge	288
Education sites	289
Government response	289
Future	290
Strengths of the approach	290

Stakeholder forum	290
Independent facilitator	291
Commitment of members and agencies	292
Weaknesses of the approach	292
Imbalanced representation of stakeholders	292
Lack of detailed marine science	293
Lack of science independence	294
Constraints on fishing information	294
Policy ambiguity	295
Insufficient time allocated	296
Lack of integration with cultural processes	297
No scope for compensation	297
No consensus	297
Duplicated effort	298
Conclusion	298
18 Sub-Antarctic Marine Protection Planning Forum	309
Introduction	310
Context	312
Social and economic environment	312
Natural environment	313
Existing marine protection	314
Stakeholder body	316
Establishment	316
Purpose	316
Membership	316
Process	318
Overview	318
Role of stakeholder body	319
Role of statutory agencies	320
Information and science	320
Public consultation	322
Outcomes	323
Forum recommendations	323
Government response	326
Future	327
Strengths of the approach	327

Stakeholder representation	327
Agency support and resourcing	327
Independent chairperson	328
Legal approach	328
Weaknesses of the approach	328
Insufficient time allocated	328
Stakeholder barriers to consensus building	329
Not all sectors represented	329
Legislation	330
Conclusion	330
19 Ngātiwai and marine reserves	335
Poor Knights Islands marine reserve	336
Aotea (Great Barrier Island) marine reserve proposal	337
Further marine protection proposals	338
APPENDICES	339
Appendix 1: New Zealand marine protected areas principles and protection standard	341
Appendix 2: Goals and principles for the establishment of the national representative system of marine protected areas in Australian Commonwealth waters	349
REFERENCES	353
INDEX	369

List of Figures

1.1	Summary of the historical context to marine protected areas legislation in New Zealand	4
2.1	Summary of the international evolution of spatial marine protection	16
3.1	Summary of potential benefits of marine protected areas	26
4.1	Summary of international approaches to marine protection	44
5.1	Summary of key elements of international best practice	61
6.1	New Zealand's marine jurisdiction	67
6.2	Summary of reasons why New Zealand needs marine protection	72
7.1	Summary of New Zealand's experience with collaborative processes for identifying marine protected areas	86
8.1	Current spatial marine management measures	94
8.2	New Zealand's marine biogeographic regions	110
8.3	Percentage of coastal biogeographic regions in marine reserves	112
8.4	Summary of New Zealand's performance compared with international best practice	114
9.1	Summary of legislative design considerations and existing legislative systems	131
10.1	Summary of legislative options	140
13.1	Overview of the Marine Life Protection Act organisational structure	190
13.2	Overview of the Marine Life Protection Act Initiative process	191
13.3	Summary of the results of implementation of the California Marine Life Protection Act	198
13.4	Summary statistics of marine protected area implementation for each region of the California coast	203
14.1	Process to declare an Australian Commonwealth reserve	208
14.2	Categories for Australian Commonwealth reserves compared to IUCN categories	210
14.3	Process to establish Australian Commonwealth marine protected areas through bioregional planning	217
14.4	Zoning rules applying to the south-east Commonwealth marine reserves network	218
14.5	Summary of marine protected areas proposed under Australian Commonwealth bioregional planning	226
15.1	New South Wales marine protected areas	231
15.2	Zones which can be applied to New South Wales marine parks	235
15.3	Zoning map for Batemans marine park	236

15.4	Summary of New South Wales marine parks	241
16.1	Fiordland marine reserves	249
16.2	Fiordland Marine Guardians members	256
16.3	Summary of agency support	259
16.4	Fiordland Marine Area monitoring programmes	264
16.5	Chronology of key events for marine protection in Fiordland	270
17.1	Members of the West Coast Marine Protection Forum	280
17.2	Locations of proposed West Coast marine protected areas and educational showcase sites	287
17.3	Timeline of key events in West Coast marine protected area planning process	299
17.4	Evaluation of options in the West Coast Marine Protection Forum's recommendation report	301
17.5	List of interviewees for West Coast Marine Protection Forum case study	305
18.1	Map of New Zealand including Sub-Antarctic Islands biogeographic region	311
18.2	Existing protection tools in the Sub-Antarctic Islands	315
18.3	Sub-Antarctic Marine Protection Planning Forum members	317
18.4	Meeting schedule for the completion of Phase 1	318
18.5	Options presented for Antipodes Island	325
18.6	Options presented for the Bounty Islands	325
18.7	Options presented for Campbell Island	325
18.8	Timeline of key events in the Sub-Antarctic marine protection planning process	331
18.9	List of interviewees for the Sub-Antarctic Marine Protection Planning Forum case study	332